

Exemplary Classroom Management Practices Among the Elementary Teachers of Bicol University Integrated Laboratory School

Marivie B. Trivette

Bicol University College of Education, Daraga, Albay, Philippines

Correspondence: marivietrivette@ymail.com

Abstract

The study identified exemplar classroom management and discipline practices which were collected in a compendium. Mixed method using survey with instructional monitoring tool, teaching template and video documentation were employed in this research. The validated teaching exemplar templates were used to extract exemplars. The respondents consisted of 10 teachers from Bicol University College of Education Integrated Laboratory School (BUCE-ILS). There were four teachers with highly evident teaching exemplar results using the instructional monitoring tool. Teachers identified with highly evident exemplar in classroom management and discipline practices were aligned to instructional moves indicator. The following practices were identified as exemplar classroom management and discipline practices: Responsive Classroom Management Using Positive Discipline, Contextualization of Total Physical Response, Flexible-Assertive Classroom Management, and Modelling Ideal Behavior Through Pictures. The findings revealed that six teachers were identified with moderate extent of teaching exemplar practices. Common strengths during actual class observation were also noted: having disciplinary plan, rewarding good behavior, instilling high expectations, prepared for disruptions, patient, and can maintain better instructional flow. Common weaknesses noted were: physical classroom setting may be more organized in a manner that promotes learning and independence, improvement in scheduling instruction in a manner that optimizes student learning, teaching activities should be more planned and implemented in ways that optimize student learning, and more responsiveness to problem behaviors. Thus, it is strongly recommended to train teachers about teaching exemplar, and to periodically review them in order to ensure their relevance and up-to-dateness because classroom management and discipline practices can also differ from one culture to the next and on local conditions.

Keywords: *Instructional Monitoring Tool, Teaching Exemplar Template, Instructional Moves*

Introduction

As a training department for student teachers in the elementary grade and catering to the educational needs of the pupils based on the K-12 Curriculum and Philippine Professional Standards for Teachers (PPST), Bicol University College of Education Integrated Laboratory School (BUCE-ILS) Elementary has a two-fold task: to prepare pre-service teachers for their chosen profession in the different subject areas and teach them with the knowledge, skills and attitudes—the competencies that they need for life- long learning in school and real life. The 2016 revised set of professional standards for beginning teachers in the Philippines, particularly domains 1 and 4 of DepEd Order No.42 S.2017 on National Adoption and Implementation of the Philippine Professional Standards

for Teachers (PPST) states that , “teachers should exhibit the needed skills in the use of communication strategies, teaching strategies, constructive classroom interactions and management, and promote high- quality learning geared towards the attainment of high standards of learning outcomes.” In line with this, a teacher in a laboratory school should model excellence and possess exemplar management and discipline practices to effectively guide the pre-service teachers. Learning how to manage a classroom effectively is a difficult task for pre-service teachers. This is compounded by the lack of attention that classroom management receives in many teacher preparations programs and in the field of education in general (Eisenman *et al.*, 2015).

Gage (2018) stressed that teachers’ classroom

management practices have a direct impact on their students' probability of success. Classroom management is intended to provide students with more opportunities to learn. Students should be able to carry out their maximum potential, which allows students to develop appropriate behavior patterns. Teachers must deal with unexpected events and have the ability to control student behavior. Identifying exemplar classroom management and disciplines can promote positive classroom climate and are considered as the essential goals of all teachers. Indeed, teachers can have a major influence on pupils' learning both academically and socially (Stronge *et al.*, 2011). To develop a high qualified exemplar teachers, Hanover Research (2012) suggested the following: pioneer new method; teachers with extensive backgrounds in their field of expertise; team teaching which allows for content specialization; serve as leaders and mentors for other teachers; provide students with opportunities for hands-on experiences and real-world applications of scientific problems; and initiate various extracurricular activities to interested students and play a significant role in developing interest among gifted students.

Exemplar teachers can influence other teachers on the methods, strategies and process to maintain an effective and efficient teaching and learning atmosphere. Their approach uses discipline to teach rather than punish and, as a result, helps students succeed and thrive in school. Schools that take this approach promote positive student behavior while preventing negative risky behaviors. Their exemplar practices can serve as a model in implementing effective classroom management and discipline practices because these are backed by experiences and evidences of successful practices. If the teacher is able to manage the class, a positive impact will likely develop and improve pupil's performance. Unal and Unal (2012) demonstrated that experienced teachers are more likely to prefer to be in control in their classrooms than beginning teachers while interacting with students when making decisions.

The identified exemplar classroom management and discipline practices collected in a compendium can help in improving educational practices since the ability to manage the classroom and to organize instruction are basic components of effective teaching. Erdogan and colleagues (2010) pointed some analysis that there are existing problems associated with classroom management such as lack of motivation, breaking the rules and routines, lack of infrastructure, insufficient time management, ineffective classroom environment, and lack of interaction in classrooms. Management problems continue to be a major cause of teacher burnout and job dissatisfaction. Strangely, despite this enduring concern

on the part of educators and the public, few researchers have chosen to focus on classroom management or to identify themselves with this critical field.

Gage (2018) stated that it is unfortunate to know that many teachers do not receive adequate classroom management training before the start of their teaching careers and feel unprepared for the demands of managing student behaviors in their classrooms. The exemplar practices can be one of the solutions to overcome disciplines and classroom management problems. Hence, the identified exemplar practices among the faculty of BUCE-ILS will provide information for pre-service and beginning teachers to become more knowledgeable, skilled and effective in their work. Supervising teachers with exemplar classroom management and discipline practices will effectively direct and guide the pre-service student teachers in the elementary level to help them achieve their ends based on the competencies in the current educational curriculum.

Materials and Methods

Research Site and Participants

All study procedures, including teacher consent, parent and pupil consent were approved by the Dean of the Bicol University College of Education. Participants volunteered in their demonstration lesson and showed cooperation in the research activities. Letters and memo communications were done formally to inform participants of the details, procedures and advantages of the research activities and participation. The teacher participants were composed of male and female, have at least 5 years of teaching experiences, age ranges from 28 to 55, with Masters Degree and Doctorate Units. All teachers in the BUCE-ILS elementary were observed in order to choose the exemplar teachers. They are all professional, licensed and experienced teachers. There were at least 2 times of observation of actual teaching done to see the teacher in action implementing the classroom management and discipline practices for the whole period of required minutes (60) of one subject. The head of the Integrated Laboratory School and co-researchers were present during the class observation. The number of students in the classroom ranged from 25 to 30 in the BUCE-ILS Elementary Classrooms.

Research Design, Instruments and Procedure

Mixed methods were used through a survey with instructional monitoring tool and a teaching

template and video documentation. It was used because the study underwent context and illustration by combining quantitative and qualitative findings to extract participants' exemplar practices. It gives sufficient data to study participants and ensure that study findings are grounded in participants' experiences and exemplar practices. Ultimately, combining the results of instructional monitoring tool and exemplar template heightened the knowledge and validity of the exemplar practices in classroom management because such data confirm and discover their specific exemplary practices (Johnson & Christensen 2017). The primary sources of data came from the anecdotal accounts and/or narrative recordings and class observation of the BUCE-ILS elementary faculty regarding their classroom management practices. Observation checklist in a form of Instructional Monitoring Tool and Teaching Exemplar Template to extract teaching exemplar practices for the class observations were prepared and validated by experts. Exemplars were identified using a rubric and instructional move derived from the Basic Elements of Best Practice Research (BPR) as discussed in Vesely's (2011) Theory and Methodology of Best Practice Research for instructional moves. Data in the instructional monitoring tool were analyzed based on actual class observation by means of checklist: 3-highly evident 2- moderately evident 1- slightly evident. All the observed indicator points were added for exemplar points, and divided by the number of criteria for classroom management. Behavior and practices were included in the criteria for frequency counts. Narrative recordings were indicated in the last part for other comments and suggestions. Anecdotal accounts were based on the observed practices on the perspective of the head of elementary department as she observed the teachers for several years based on her wisdom and judgment.

Instructional Monitoring Tool

The instructional monitoring tool uses 3 scales to identify the evidence of teaching exemplar as highly evident, moderately evident, and slightly evident and was validated by 3 jurors. There were 13 indicators for instructional monitoring tool: Physical Setting, Scheduling, Instructional Planning and Delivery, Classroom Discipline Plan, Activating-Connecting, Affirming-Appreciating, Explaining, Giving directions, Grouping, Guiding Practice, Motivating, Nurturing-Mentoring, and Redirecting. These tools were used to select exemplar teachers based from the rank of their exemplar points.

Teaching Exemplar Template

In order to extract the teaching exemplar practices, a template was adapted from Southern Cross University but has been modified with the inclusion of the following: Title of Exemplar, Brief Description, Objectives, Goals, Teaching and Learning Areas Addressed by Lesson Exemplar, Content of Exemplar, Process, Impact on Learning, and Tips for Best Practices. These templates were accomplished by the teachers after the final demonstration and focused group discussion about the identified exemplar classroom management practices discussing the different parts of the template. The results of the focused group discussion were incorporated in the different parts of the teaching exemplar template.

Video Documentation

Teachers with highly evident exemplar practices were interviewed about the contents of the teaching exemplar template and were asked to have a final demonstration of their exemplar classroom practices in classroom management and discipline practices. They were also requested to give their exemplar lesson plans. A final demonstrations of exemplar classroom management practices were conducted and documented (through video for compendium) to fully substantiate and validate the narratives and observation notes.

Results and Discussion

There were four (4) teachers with highly evident exemplar points in classroom management results using the instructional monitoring tool (Table 1). Teachers with highly evident exemplar practices were given a teaching exemplar template to identify exemplar classroom management and discipline practices.

There were 6 general practices in classroom management and discipline practices that were noted among the faculty of BUCEILS-Elementary faculty: They have a disciplinary plan, reward good behavior, instill high expectations, are prepared for disruptions, are patient, and can maintain better instructional flow. There were 4 teachers with highly evident teaching exemplar results using the instructional monitoring tool as indicators for teaching exemplar. Common weaknesses noted were physical classroom setting may be more organized in a manner that promotes learning and independence, improvement in scheduling instruction in a manner that optimizes student learning, teaching activities should be more planned and implemented in ways that optimize

Table 1. Summary Sheet-Instructional Monitoring Tool (Classroom Management & Discipline Practices)

Teacher Observed	Total (Exemplar Points)	Average
Teacher Observed A	39	3.00
Teacher Observed B	35	2.69
Teacher Observed C	33	2.26
Teacher Observed D	19	1.46
Teacher Observed E	39	3.00
Teacher Observed F	15	1.15
Teacher Observed G	25	1.92
Teacher Observed H	33	2.26
Teacher Observed I	39	3.00
Teacher Observed J	26	2.00
Total	30.3	2.33

Legend: 2.5-3.0 (Highly evident), 2.49-1.5 (Moderately evident), 1.49-1.0 (Slightly evident)

student learning, and more responsiveness to problem behaviors.

Principal Findings

The following practices were identified as exemplar classroom management and discipline practices following the accomplished teaching exemplar template given to the exemplar faculty of BUCE-ILS Elementary: responsive classroom management using positive discipline, contextualized total physical response, flexible-assertive classroom management, and model ideal behavior through pictures. The findings revealed that the majority of the teachers were identified with moderate extent of teaching exemplar practices, and that teachers identified as highly evident exemplar in classroom management and discipline practices were aligned to instructional moves indicator. Common strengths and weakness during actual class observation were noted.

Exemplar 1- Responsive Classroom Management Using Positive Discipline

This is an evidence based social and emotional learning approach. It uses positive discipline to develop awareness and create a positive tone of learning. The primary goals of this approach are to establish calm, orderly and safe environment for learning, help children develop self-control and self-discipline, teach children to be responsible contributing members to their

community, and to promote respect, kind, and healthy teacher-student, student-student interactions (Brady *et al.*, 2011). Exemplar teacher 1 was evidently observed as using reinforcing language and communicates behavior expectations clearly and imposes logical consequences with fairness and consistency, using a firm and caring demeanor words and tone. Some of his words were “I’m so glad that you expressed your hopes and dreams clearly in your writing activity, it shows that you put careful thought into what you want to achieve”; “You used lots of positive describing words. That will really encourage readers to read your story!”, “I can see that you worked really hard on your writing today, Joshua, your classmates reacted with enthusiasm when you read it aloud”; “Great job, you did so many things well today! You followed quickly and safely on the directions given, kept hands and bodies under control, focused on my directions, and projected your movement during each practice, those skills will help us give a terrific performance.” These practices made his students feel physically and emotionally safe in school so that his students can learn at their best and help in developing self-discipline and skill, and for working cooperatively among his students and their peers (Wood & Freeman-Loftis, 2011).

Specifically, the following practices were identified: uses reinforcing language when a student behaves positively; uses reminding language when he noticed a student just starting to go off course; tried nonverbal cues when a child behaves in a problematic way; Logical consequences were introduced carefully and used skillfully if they’re to remain non-punitive; responds to students through effective use of questioning which can assist students in constructing new knowledge and information; seizes teachable moments with sense of intentionality; promotes independence in students through selection of classroom activities, routines and structures; maintains a better sense of instructional flow; and teaches students on what to do when they encountered difficult aspects of the different process of learning.

As a result of these exemplar practices, the students developed the intrinsic motivation to take care of themselves, and their own learning. Wood and Freeman-Loftis (2011) emphasized that by implementing best rules, students learn how to build a solid foundation for positive behavior. Additionally, imposing classroom discipline should have parental involvement and collaboration, positive reinforcement and affection, constancy and consistency, knowing students on a personal level, calmness and composure, and constructive approaches as Virtudazo and Gubao (2020) described the

lived experiences of public-school teachers on student discipline. Exemplar teacher 1 created effective rules that strengthens classroom community and responds to both common and complex misbehaviors and helped students who struggle with behavior due to trauma or toxic stress. He also communicated with parents and built a network of support for students. These practices foster essential social-emotional and academic skills in the classroom - creating learning environments where every student can thrive. These supports the work of Osher and colleagues (2010) that the teacher's main duty is to facilitate and maintain order in the classroom within a pupil-centered pedagogy and positive behavioral support such as recognition and discussion. They recommended three approaches to improving school discipline practices and student behavior: ecological approaches to classroom management, school wide positive behavioral supports, and social and emotional learning.

Exemplar 2 - Contextualized Total Physical Response, Using Start Sheet Point System Strategy

This is a method of teaching language or vocabulary concepts by using physical movement to react to verbal input in meaningful yet fun learning activities. Harrasi (2014) affirmed that among several approaches to teaching and learning a foreign language, Total Physical Response, or TPR, is one that simulates the way children naturally particularly in acquiring their mother tongue. Instructors give commands to students in the new language, and students respond through gestures. However, Exemplar Teacher 2 in her Science class contextualized the action based on Science Concepts. Sample quotes were "I will show you the action for solid, liquid and gas." "This group followed perfectly the actions, definitely they will receive additional points." "These statements transformed from boring and lifeless to connected, personalized, and exciting. It can indicate a high level of confidence to the students. The identified exemplar practices were: a) firm with the standards/mechanics so that the students will respond with clarity b) Materials/Props were available when implementing the TPR; c) Modeling of the action to be made; as the teacher modelled, d) Repetition and practice can be made to master words /concepts in the lesson; e) uses Start Sheet Point System (SSPS) Strategy to maintain discipline during activities and discussions; f) provide activities where in before the activity, standards were explained well for clarity.; g) Pupils get points or stars as a reward of their good behavior during the whole lesson; h) Knows when to follow the lead of the pupils especially when it suggested a direction in which pupils need to head; i) Integrate other skills effectively in content areas; and j) Viewed her students are capable for

becoming masters of the skills endowed to them.

DeBord (2019) described teachers using blended Learning with Coaching Course on Total Physical Response Storytelling (TPRS) in their classroom instruction of vocabulary transformed from boring and lifeless to connected, personalized, and exciting. It can indicate a high level of confidence that students' posttest results will improve after teachers participate in the Blended Learning with Coaching Course on TPRS. Pujiningsih (2010) suggested that in teaching English using TPR, the activities actually can be modified based on the students' interest as long as it covers the four aspects of vocabulary mastery, students should be totally in getting involved in the teaching learning process and bear in mind that making mistakes is part of learning process and they need not to be afraid of.

Exemplar 3 - Flexible – Assertive Discipline Style

This type of classroom management needs learning styles grouping. These are temporary groups, with little or no time spent on assigning people to groups, getting into groups, or assigning roles. They last one session or less and are used to ensure cognitive processing and engagement in learning. The roles of the students in a group may vary depending on the kind of learning activities and topics. The following were the identified practices of Exemplar 3 teacher: demonstrates that she has the "right" to decide what is best her students; confidently determines what is best for all students and then expect compliance; remains assertive, not aggressively or passively; consistently assertive of she wants and expected behavior in the classroom; ensures cognitive processing and engagement in learning, by grouping students without being biased and being fair and engage students with higher-level content that is thought-provoking, difficult to understand, or has multiple interpretations; allows for differences of personality and supportive friendships; has no room for negatively disruptive behavior, bullying, or ostracizing of other students.

Sample quotes were "turn-to-your-neighbor", "form teams of three", "Count off from one to six";...All of the ones would become a group and so on; Uses color-coded cards or playing cards—students pick up cards as they enter class and all students with the same color (or same number) work together; Very Good, I am so happy that you can follow such directions and rules, it feels good seeing you organized as a group..." "This works well, because the students see the teacher is firmly requesting a standard of behavior, and she is going to take assertive steps to ensure that students respect their wishes. Some

of her exemplar practices were: Makes the rules very clear; not be ambiguous; Catches students being "good."; Recognizes and supports students when they behave appropriately; Consistently letting the students know she is happy with good behavior, mentioning specifically what it is...; Rewards exceptional behavior; Makes clear what the consequences are for bad behavior; and Follows through with negative consequences for breaking the rules. Kaya and colleagues (2010), confirmed that mostly, this is the teachers' preferences toward a more assertive discipline model (Rules and Consequences) and decreased their preferences toward the humanistic discipline model (Relationship–Listening).

Exemplar 4 - Model Ideal Behavior through Pictures

This strategy can be utilized across discipline to minimize/lessen unruly behavior. Students are usually visual learners, so they respond quickly to picture clues shown by the teacher. Exemplar 4 teacher demonstrated that once pointed at the behavior shown in the picture, must be done by the students. The teacher must be firm and strict enough so that all students in the classroom behave as such. Under classroom management, the teacher is able to promote and provide positive discipline towards unruly and disruptive behavior without burning out. Sample of her quotes, "Children, look at the pictures, these images suggest the behavior I want to see in your class, the 1st picture means, "silence or keep quiet", 2nd picture, means" stop whatever you are doing", and the 3rd picture, "stand up and think of the answer". Showing the behavior through pictures;" Once the picture was pointed at it when they tend to be unruly, they will already see and do what is expected of them when the teacher is teaching; and she innovates attractive pictures that suggest good behavior. It was observed that when the behavior is managed, there will be a smooth flow of the lesson and activities therein.

The following were the identified practices: Posts the desirable/ideal behavior on the board where the students clearly see all of it; Explains to the class what it is for and what each picture shows; and Tells the class to follow or obey it once the teacher point at it., Emphasizes that one must demonstrate the behavior you want them to see, it does not do away much to what is already effective, but she levelled it up by already showing the behavior through pictures; Pointed at it when they tend to be unruly, they will already see and do what is expected of them when the teacher is teaching; and Innovates attractive pictures that suggest good behavior. It was observed that when the behavior is managed, there will be a smooth flow of the lesson and activities therein.

Sieberer-Nagler (2015) suggested that innovative methods for transforming common classroom management struggles can be turned into opportunities for positive change and for changing negative behaviors into positive interactions. Milner and Tenore (2010) state that, "in creating commitment in the classroom, it is important to know more about what to innovate and understand more of our pupils as a foundation on good relationships and positive direction". In today's distance, virtual and e-learning, aside from using pictures to model ideal behavior, Cheng and Chen (2020) suggested that teachers may explore social networking apps through electronic devices such as smartphones, tablet computers, and personal computers for classroom management effectiveness enhancement with the role of parental involvement.

The identified exemplar practices among the faculty of Bicol University Integrated Laboratory School can provide information for pre-service and beginning teachers to become more knowledgeable, skilled and effective in their work. Future researches in measuring the extent in teacher preparation programs which includes training teachers in research-based classroom management strategies, (Greenberg *et al.*, 2014), for keeping pace with emerging practices like immersive virtual reality (VR) system for training classroom management skills and web-based classroom management are imperative in today's time (Boyaci, 2010). Lugin and colleagues (2016) emphasized that this should be with a specific focus on learning to manage disruptive student behavior in face-to-face, one-to-many teaching scenarios are indeed imperative. Greenberg and colleagues (2014) reported the five most important strategies on which to train teacher candidates known as the "Big Five": (1) Rules; (2) Routines; (3) Praise; (4) Misbehavior; and (5) Engagement.

Choa and colleagues (2020) analyzed and reviewed the content and methodologies of over two decades of empirical research on classroom management and describes how the field has conceived of technology's roles in classroom management and school discipline. These roles include training teachers, supporting educators' day-to-day practices, and promoting self-discipline or self-regulation among students. Boyaci (2010) emphasized that guiding/mentoring on technical issues, on the field knowledge, classroom interactions were defined by the students as the essential leadership roles of teachers. Pas and colleagues (2016) suggested that coaching teachers is one way to support teachers' development of such culturally responsive classroom management strategies; However, they said that there

is limited research on the implementation and teacher-perceived acceptability of coaching, both broadly and specifically for this set of skills.

Research findings presented here may not have enough exemplar practices about classroom management and discipline practices because it can differ from one culture to the next, as Wubbels (2011) claims that how the teacher manages the class probably depends on local conditions than culture. Riley and colleagues (2010) suggest that teachers must be mindfully present in her /her own classroom context and use theory as a thinking tool in the classroom management, because when teachers acquire knowledge about classroom management, this does not mean that they can apply this in a technical or mechanical manner. Evertson and Weinstein (2013) concluded that classroom management problems consistently rank as the first or second most serious educational problem in the eyes of the general public, and beginning teachers consistently rank it as their most pressing concern during their early teaching years. Future research could therefore focus on local conditions of pupils such as managing exceptional situations like distance/e-learning management on synchronous learning and other existing conditions.

Acknowledgment

The researcher wishes to express her deep gratitude and appreciation to the BUCE-ILS Elementary teachers who demonstrated exemplar classroom management and discipline practices.

References

- Al Harrasi, K. T. S. (2014). Using "Total physical response" with young learners in Oman. *Childhood Education*, 90(1), 36-42.
- Boyaci, A. (2010). Re-Service Teachers' Views On Web-Based Classroom Management. *Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education*, 11(2), 208-234.
- Brady, K., Forton, M. B., & Porter, D. (2011). Rules in school: Teaching discipline in the responsive classroom. Center for Responsive Schools, Inc.
- Cho, V., Mansfield, K. C., & Claughton, J. (2020). The past and future technology in classroom management and school discipline: A systematic review. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 90, 103037.
- Cheng, Y. H., & Chen, Y. C. (2018). Enhancing classroom management through parental involvement by using social networking apps. *South African Journal of Education*, 38(1).
- DeBord, A. (2019). The impact of blended professional learning focused on total physical response storytelling (TPRS®) on teacher perceptions and practices. Gardner-Webb University.
- Department of Education. (n.d.). DO 42, s. 2017 – National Adoption and Implementation of the Philippine Professional Standards for Teachers. Department of Education. <https://www.deped.gov.ph/2017/08/11/do-42-s-2017-national-adoption-andimplementation-of-the-philippineprofessional-standards-for-teachers/>.
- Erdogan, M., Kursun, E., Sisman, G. T., Saltan, F., Gok, A., & Yildiz, I. (2010). A Qualitative Study on Classroom Management and Classroom Discipline Problems, Reasons, and Solutions: A Case of Information Technologies Class. *Educational Sciences: Theory and Practice*, 10(2), 881-891.
- Eisenman, G., Edwards, S., & Cushman, C. A. (2015). Bringing Reality to Classroom Management in Teacher Education. *Professional Educator*, 39(1), n1.
- Evertson, C. M., & Weinstein, C. S. (2013). *Handbook of classroom management: Research, practice, and contemporary issues*. Routledge.
- Gage, N. A., Scott, T., Hirn, R., & MacSuga-Gage, A. S. (2018). The relationship between teachers' implementation of classroom management practices and student behavior in elementary school. *Behavioral Disorders*, 43(2), 302-315.
- Greenberg, J., Putman, H., & Walsh, K. (2014). *Training Our Future Teachers: Classroom Management*. Revised. National Council on Teacher Quality.
- Hanover Research. (2012). (rep.). *Best Practices in Elementary STEM Programs* (pp. 1–30). Washington, DC: Hanover Research.
- Johnson, R. B., & Christensen, L. (2019). *Educational research: Quantitative, qualitative, and mixed approaches*. Sage publications.
- Kaya, S., Lundeen, C., & Wolfgang, C. H. (2010). Discipline orientations of pre-service teachers before and after student teaching. *Teaching Education*, 21(2), 157-169.
- Lugrin, J. L., Latoschik, M. E., Habel, M., Roth, D., Seufert, C., & Grafe, S. (2016). Breaking bad behaviors: A new tool for learning classroom management using virtual reality. *Frontiers in ICT*, 3, 26.
- Milner IV, H. R., & Tenore, F. B. (2010). Classroom management in diverse classrooms. *Urban Education*, 45(5), 560-603.
- Osher, D., Bear, G. G., Sprague, J. R., & Doyle, W. (2010). How

- can we improve school discipline?. Educational researcher, 39(1), 48-58.
- Pas, E. T., Larson, K. E., Reinke, W. M., Herman, K. C., & Bradshaw, C. P. (2016). Implementation and acceptability of an adapted classroom check-up coaching model to promote culturally responsive classroom management. *Education and Treatment of Children*, 39(4), 467-491.
- Pujiningsih, N. (2010). Improving students' English vocabulary by using total physical response (a classroom action research in the sixth year of MI NU Manafiul Ulum Kudus in the academic year of 2009-2010) (Doctoral dissertation, UNS (Sebelas Maret University)).
- Riley, P., Lewis, R. & Brew, C. (2010) Why did You do That? Teachers Explain the Use of Legal Aggression in the Classroom, *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 26(4), 957-964.
- Sieberer-Nagler, K. (2016). Effective classroom management & positive teaching. *English Language Teaching*, 9(1), 163-172.
- Stronge, J. H., Ward, T. J., & Grant, L. W. (2011). What makes good teachers good? A cross-case analysis of the connection between teacher effectiveness and student achievement. *Journal of teacher Education*, 62(4), 339-355.
- Unal, Z., & Unal, A. (2012). The Impact of Years of Teaching Experience on the Classroom Management Approaches of Elementary School Teachers. *Online Submission*, 5(2), 41- 60.
- Vesely, A. (2011). Theory and methodology of best practice research: a critical review of the current state. *Central European Journal of Public Policy*, 5(02), 98-117.
- Virtudazo, M. C. A., & Guhao, E. S. (2020). Student Discipline in The Classroom: Public School Teachers' Point of View. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 9(1), 271- 282.
- Wood, C., & Freeman-Loftis, B. (2011). Responsive school discipline: Essentials for elementary school leaders. Center for Responsive Schools, Inc..
- Wubbels, T. (2011) An International Perspective on Classroom Management: what should prospective teachers learn, *Teaching Education*, 22(2), 113-131.